

# Central Lancashire Online Knowledge (CLoK)

Title	Spectrochemical determination of unique bacterial responses following
	long-term low-level exposure to antimicrobials
Туре	Article
URL	https://clok.uclan.ac.uk/22011/
DOI	https://doi.org/10.1039/c8ay00011e
Date	2018
Citation	Jin, Naifu, Semple, Kirk T., Jiang, Longfei, Luo, Chunling, Martin, Francis L and Zhang, Dayi (2018) Spectrochemical determination of unique bacterial responses following long-term low-level exposure to antimicrobials. Analytical Methods, 10. pp. 1602-1611. ISSN 1759-9660
Creators	Jin, Naifu, Semple, Kirk T., Jiang, Longfei, Luo, Chunling, Martin, Francis L and Zhang, Dayi

It is advisable to refer to the publisher's version if you intend to cite from the work. https://doi.org/10.1039/c8ay00011e

For information about Research at UCLan please go to <a href="http://www.uclan.ac.uk/research/">http://www.uclan.ac.uk/research/</a>

All outputs in CLoK are protected by Intellectual Property Rights law, including Copyright law. Copyright, IPR and Moral Rights for the works on this site are retained by the individual authors and/or other copyright owners. Terms and conditions for use of this material are defined in the <u>http://clok.uclan.ac.uk/policies/</u>

1	Spectrochemical determination of unique bacterial responses following long-term low-
2	level exposure to antimicrobials
3	Naifu Jin <sup>a,b</sup> , Kirk T Semple <sup>a</sup> , Longfei Jiang <sup>c</sup> , Chunling Luo <sup>c</sup> , Francis L Martin <sup>d,*</sup> , Dayi
4	Zhang <sup>a,b,*</sup>
5	<sup>a</sup> Lancaster Environment Centre, Lancaster University, Lancaster LA1 4YQ, UK
6	<sup>b</sup> School of Environment, Tsinghua University, Beijing 100084, China
7	<sup>c</sup> Guangzhou Institute of Geochemistry, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Guangzhou 510640,
8	China
9	<sup>d</sup> School of Pharmacy and Biomedical Sciences, University of Central Lancashire, Preston
10	PR1 2HE, UK
11	
12	*Corresponding authors:
13	Francis L Martin, School of Pharmacy and Biomedical Sciences, University of Central
14	Lancashire, Preston PR1 2HE, UK; Email: flmartin@uclan.ac.uk
15	Dayi Zhang, School of Environment, Tsinghua University, Beijing 100084, China; Email:
16	<u>zhangdayi@tsinghua.org.cn</u>
17	

# 18 ToC graphic



### 22 Abstract

Agents arising from engineering or pharmaceutical industries may induce significant 23 environmental impacts. Particularly, antimicrobials not only act as efficient eliminators of 24 certain microbes but also facilitate the propagation of organisms with antimicrobial resistance, 25 raising critical health issues, *e.g.*, the bloom of multidrug-resistant bacteria. Although many 26 investigations have examined microbial responses to antimicrobials and characterized 27 relevant mechanisms, they have focused mainly on high-level and short-term exposures, 28 29 instead of simulating real-world scenarios in which the antimicrobial exposure is at a lowlevel for long periods. Herein, we developed a spectrochemical tool, attenuated total 30 31 reflection Fourier-transform infrared (ATR-FTIR) spectroscopy, as a high-throughput and nondestructive approach to interrogate the long-term effects of low-level antimicrobial 32 33 exposure in bacterial cells. Post-exposure to nanoparticulate silver (AgNP), tetracycline or their mixtures for 12 days, Gram-positive (Mycobacterium vanbaalenii PYR-1) and Gram-34 35 negative (*Pseudomonas fluorescens*) bacteria exhibited distinct IR spectral alterations. Multivariate analysis coupled with multivariate regression tree (MRT) indicates nutrient 36 depletion and exposure time as the primary factors in bacterial behaviour, followed by 37 exposure category and bacterial type. Nutrient depletion and starvation during long-term 38 exposure drives bacterial cells into a dormant state or to exhibit additional cellular 39 40 components (e.g., fatty acids) in response to antimicrobials, consequently causing a broader range of spectral alterations compared to short-term exposure. This work is the first report 41 highlighting the more important roles of exposure duration and nutrient depletion, instead of 42 treatment regimen of antimicrobial, on microbial responses to low-level and prolonged 43 44 environmental exposures.

### 46 **1. Introduction**

Environmental exposure to antimicrobials is a critical issue for both human and microbial 47 communities. Antibiotics are currently ranked as the third most commonly prescribed drugs<sup>1</sup>. 48 In human and veterinary medicine there is abuse of antibiotics, especially for keeping animals 49 healthy at a sub-therapeutic level<sup>2-9</sup>. The primary sink for such antibiotic usage is the 50 environment, *e.g.*, waters and soils, *via* various pathways post-excretion<sup>2, 3, 4, 6</sup>. Another group 51 of frequently-used antimicrobial agents is silver-associated entities. Notably, unlike silver ion 52 or salts whose antimicrobial effects are well-studied, the mechanisms of nanoparticulate 53 silver (AgNP) activity remain unclear. However, AgNP is widely exploited for its 54 antibacterial activity, in clothing, food containers, wound dressings, ointments, implant 55 coatings, and ultrafiltration membranes for water purification<sup>10-14</sup>. Developing a reliable 56 approach to interrogate microbial responses to antimicrobials is therefore a matter of urgency, 57 contributing to better understanding of the mechanisms and impacts of antimicrobial agents 58 on environmental microbes<sup>15</sup>. 59

60 A major issue is the translation from laboratory culture to the real-world scenario of bacteria living in their natural habitats. In contrast to most laboratory culture conditions, e.g., 61 nutrient rich broth, free-living bacteria commonly face nutrient depletion or even more 62 prohibitive circumstances<sup>16</sup>. For instance, cells inhabiting biofilm may be exposed to 63 different concentrations of nutrients, metabolites or environmental stimuli (e.g., temperature, 64 pH, oxygen, etc.)<sup>17-21</sup> across the biofilm matrix and local microenvironment, leading to 65 heterogeneous growth rates and behaviours amongst the cell populations<sup>22, 23</sup>. Amongst these, 66 a small proportion might differentiate into a highly protected phenotypic state and coexist 67 with neighbouring populations that are antibiotic sensitive, resulting from inherent strain 68 differences and adaptation to relatively low concentrations of exposure<sup>16, 22, 23</sup>. Moreover, 69 although regulatory agencies and pharmaceutical administration generally employs high 70 doses of antimicrobials in *in-vivo* and *in-vitro* trials to ensure the safety of test chemicals, 71 72 residual exposure is typically associated with extremely low-levels in the physical environment; this raises question as to whether high-concentrations of exposure represent the 73 real-world outcomes<sup>24-29</sup>. Thus, research on prolonged low-level exposures of antimicrobials 74 75 is required in order to shed deeper insights into microbial responses to antimicrobials in the real-world environment<sup>15</sup>. 76

77 Despite recently developed molecular techniques towards targeting microbial phenotypes, such approaches to identify minor or pre-stage phenotypic alterations induced by 78 low-level exposure remain limited<sup>30-33</sup>. Meanwhile, other confounding factors (e.g., microbial 79 species, growth phase, exposure time, etc.) may also influence test results<sup>16, 31, 34</sup>. In 1991, 80 Fourier-transform infrared (FTIR) spectroscopy was innovatively introduced as a sensitive 81 and rapid screening tool for the characterization, classification and identification of 82 microorganisms<sup>16</sup>. Since then, the emerging application of spectrochemical techniques with 83 computational analysis as an inter-discipline approach shows promising feasibility in 84 microbiology and cytology<sup>30-36</sup>. In the last decade, FTIR spectroscopy plus chemometrics has 85 been exploited broadly for identifying microbial identities, physiologies, activities and related 86 functions<sup>16, 30, 31, 33, 34, 37, 38</sup>. This technical combination provides a major advantage in terms 87 of being high-throughput, label-free and cost-effective in application<sup>30</sup>, allowing one to 88 interrogate biological samples *via* a nondestructive and nonintrusive manner, which has great 89 potential in monitoring real-world scenarios<sup>30-32, 34</sup>. 90

91 The current study applied attenuated total reflection FTIR (ATR-FTIR) microscopy 92 coupled with multivariate analysis to investigate bacterial responses to prolonged low-level 93 exposures of AgNP and tetracycline under nutrient depletion conditions. Compared to short-94 term exposure, we found that length of exposure plays a more important role than treatment 95 with antimicrobial reagents or bacterial type, further uncovering key influential factors of 96 bacterial responses to antimicrobials during cell growth associated with nutrient depletion.

# 97 2. Methodology

# 98 2.1 Cell strains and sample preparation

99 The two bacterial strains used in this study were Mycobacterium vanbaalenii PYR-1 (Grampositive; originally isolated by Carl E Cerniglia and stored in the culture collection 100 https://www.dsmz.de/catalogues/details/culture/DSM-7251.html) and Pseudomonas 101 fluorescens (Gram-negative; originally isolated in the laboratory of Kirk T Semple at 102 Lancaster University and gifted for purposes of this study). They were both grown in minimal 103 medium with 20 mM sodium succinate, undertaken in a dark rotary shaker at 150 rpm and the 104 culture temperature was 30±2°C. After centrifugation and washing with sterile water, cell 105 pellets were diluted in fresh minimal medium with 20 mM sodium succinate and cultivated 106 for about 2 h until they reached the early log-phase (CFU= $1 \times 10^7$  cells/mL). The four 107 treatments included non-exposure negative control (CK), 4 µg/L of AgNP, 1 µg/L of 108

- tetracycline, and a mixture with 4  $\mu$ g/L of AgNP and 1  $\mu$ g/L of tetracycline (Binary). The 109 concentrations of AgNP and tetracycline were selected according to their previous reported 110 level in natural environment to mimic the low-level exposure in real-world scenario<sup>38</sup>. They 111 are about 2-4 orders of magnitude lower than the minimum inhibitory concentration (MIC) of 112 AgNP (1 to 10 mg/L)<sup>39, 40</sup> and tetracycline (1 to >30 mg/L)<sup>41, 42</sup>, and therefore do not inhibit 113 bacterial growth. The samples of short-term exposure were taken after 2 h (late log-phase, T<sub>0</sub>) 114 and 48 h (T<sub>1</sub>), respectively. To create a nutrient-depletion condition for long-term exposure, 115 the cells were cultivated in 10-times diluted minimal medium and the culture medium was 116 117 refreshed every 72 h. The samples were collected at 3 (T<sub>2</sub>), 6 (T<sub>3</sub>), 9 (T<sub>4</sub>) and 12 (T<sub>5</sub>) days. The collected cells were then harvested by centrifugation at 4000 rcf for 5 min, washed three 118 times with sterile deionized water, and finally fixed with 70% ethanol to prevent further 119 120 exposure.
- 121 2.2 Spectrochemical analysis

The prepared samples (minimal amount > 5  $\mu$ L) were then applied onto Low-E slides and 122 dried for analysis by ATR-FTIR spectroscopy. A Bruker TENSOR 27 FTIR spectrometer 123 (Bruker Optics Ltd., UK) with a Helios ATR attachment containing a diamond internal 124 reflection element (IRE) was applied to acquire IR spectra. The data were attained at a 125 resolution of 3.84 cm<sup>-1</sup>, 2.2 kHz mirror velocity and 32 co-additions. The instrument 126 parameters were set at 32 scans and 16  $cm^{-1}$  resolution. To collect the data, a total of 30 127 individual spectral measurements were taken randomly from each sample using the aid of the 128 129 ATR magnification-limited viewfinder camera. Prior to analysing each new specimen, the 130 crystal was cleaned using deionized water and a background reading was taken.

131 2.3 Multivariate analysis and statistics

All the initial data generated from ATR-FTIR spectroscopy were analysed using MATLAB R2011a (*TheMathsWorks, Natick, MA, USA*) coupled with the IRootLab toolbox (<u>http://irootlab.googlecode.com</u>)<sup>43</sup>. The acquired IR spectra were merged and cut to the biochemical-cell fingerprint region (1800-900 cm<sup>-1</sup>). Then a rubber-band baseline correction was applied to remove any slopes in this area. The data were then normalized to Amide I (1650 cm<sup>-1</sup>) and the means were centered allowing alignment of the different spectra for comparison.

Principal component analysis-linear discriminant analysis (PCA-LDA) was applied
 after data pre-processing to reduce the number of spectra to 10 uncorrelated principal

141 components (PCs), which account for >99% of the total variance. LDA is a suprevised 142 technique coupled with PCA in order to maximize interclass and minimize intraclass 143 varance<sup>30, 31, 44</sup>. Cross-calculation was subsequently performed to mitigate risks resulting from 144 LDA overfitting<sup>45</sup>. The PCA-LDA loadings using (*n*-1) samples (n = number of samples in 145 dataset) was trained *via* leave-one-out cross-validation and then calculated the scores of the 146 rest sample. This process was performed for all scores within the test.

PCA-LDA cluster vectors are pseudo-spectra highlighting the key biochemical alterations of each group in the dataset<sup>35</sup>, which allows one to simplify the identification of discriminating differences amongst groups. The centre of the control cluster itself is moved to the origin of the PCA-LDA factor space. The extent of peak deviation away from the origin of the factor space then occurs according to the centre of each corresponding agent-induced cluster, proportional to the discriminating extent of biochemical differences<sup>31, 45</sup>. Cluster vectors plots were also applied to indicate the most prominent six significant peaks.

Multivariate regression trees (MRT) were used to analyse the influence of bacterial type, exposure time and exposure category on biospectral alterations using the R package "mvpart". Herein, Gram-positive (*M. vanbaalenii*) and Gram-negative (*P. fluorescens*) strains were assigned as 1 and 0. The exposure of AgNP, tetracycline and their mixtures were assigned as 1, 2 and 3, respectively. The samples collected at different time points (T<sub>0</sub>, T<sub>1</sub>, T<sub>2</sub>, T<sub>3</sub>, T<sub>4</sub> and T<sub>5</sub>) were assigned to 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 and 6, respectively.

160 One-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) with Tukey's post-hoc test/or *t*-test was 161 employed to test the differences between treatments. All statistical analyses were carried out 162 in GraphPad Prism 6.

## 163 **3. Results and discussion**

# 164 *3.1 Growth-dependent spectrochemical alterations*

165 Throughout the study, a spectral class mean for the bacterial control group has been derived, 166 which generates an average spectrum based on all raw data from the same group. However, 167 minor variability is visualised from the class mean data directly between groups at different 168 time points (Figure 1A and 1B). Although previous studies suggest that bacteria with limited 169 nutrients are more likely to enter a dormant state waiting suitable growth conditions<sup>46, 47</sup>, the 170 spectral alterations induced by nutrient depletion are limited. Therefore, a further cluster 171 vectors analysis is applied to highlight the minor alterations derived from nutrient depletion

(Figure 1C and 1D). The identical spectral biomarkers in both Gram-positive (M. Vanbaalenii) 172 and Gram-negative (P. fluorescens) bacteria are associated with Amide I, Amide III (~1204 173  $cm^{-1}$ , ~1647  $cm^{-1}$ )<sup>30, 33</sup> (Table 1). The main changes appearing in *M. Vanbaalenii* are Amide 174 III, (~1204 cm<sup>-1</sup>, ~1400 cm<sup>-1</sup>), C=N adenine (~1574 cm<sup>-1</sup>), Amide I (~1652 cm<sup>-1</sup>), and C=O 175 band  $(\sim 1725 \text{ cm}^{-1})^{33, 48}$ . Of these, the amino acid-associated alterations possibly contributing 176 to nucleotide metabolism, which is important for cellular catabolism are significant. Along 177 with long-term starvation and oxygen depletion, decreasing amounts of nucleotides are 178 associated with reduced cell activities and replication compared to log-phase. Furthermore, 179 alterations in other cellular components (e.g., proteins) might be mainly responsible for cell 180 wall maintenance, based on previous study<sup>49</sup>. 181

The specific spectrochemical alterations of P. fluorescens include Amide III (~1278 182  $cm^{-1}$ ), CH<sub>2</sub> bending of the methylene chains in lipids (~1470 cm<sup>-1</sup>), protein Amide II 183 absorption (~1540 cm<sup>-1</sup>), C=N cytosine (~1601 cm<sup>-1</sup>), v(C=C) lipids, and fatty acids (~1750 184  $cm^{-1}$ )<sup>34, 48</sup>. Accordingly, more lipid alterations under nutrient depletion conditions are found 185 in Gram-negative P. fluorescens versus Gram-positive M. vanbaalenii owing to their 186 differing cell wall structures. There is only a thin peptidoglycan layer (~2-3 nm) between the 187 cytoplasmic and outer membrane in Gram-negative bacteria, whereas the outer membrane in 188 Gram-positive bacteria is a thick peptidoglycan layer of 30 nm with no other additional 189 structure<sup>50</sup>. The attributes of membrane structure may explain the distinct spectrochemical 190 191 alterations between P. fluorescens and M. vanbaalenii under nutrient depletion, which might lead to different responses towards long-term exposure of antimicrobials. 192



Figure 1. Spectrochemical alterations with length of culture. Infrared spectra of *M. vanbaalenii* (A) and *P. fluorescens* (C) from control group. Cluster vectors plots of *M. vanbaalenii* (B) and *P. fluorescens* (D) from control group, indicating significant
wavenumbers contributing to segregating spectral alterations that develop with increasing
culture time.

**Table 1.** Spectrochemical profile regarding the significant spectral biomarkers peaks derived from cluster vectors of *M. vanbaalenii* (Gram-

200 positive) and *P. fluorescens* (Gram-negative) post-exposure to AgNP, tetracycline and their mixtures. Red dots represent identical biomarkers for

both Gram-positive and Gram-negative bacteria, and green and blue dots indicate biomarkers appear only in Gram-positive or Gram-negative

202 bacteria, respectively.

Wavenumber	Annotation	Gram-positive				i-positive         Growth         AgNP         Tetracycline         Binary           Image:			
(cm <sup>-1</sup> )	Annotation	Growth	AgNP	Tetracycline	Binary	Growth	AgNP	Tetracycline	Binary
~ 964	C-C, C-O deoxyribose	-	٠	-	-	-	-	-	-
~ 1084	DNA	-	-	٠	•	-	-	-	-
~ 1204	Amide III	•	-	-	-	•	-	-	-
~ 1212	Phosphate	-	•	-	-	-	-	-	-
~ 1220	PO <sub>2</sub> <sup>-</sup> stretching in RNA and DNA	-	-	•	•	-	-	•	-
~ 1278	Amide III	-	-	-	-	•	-	-	-
~ 1307	Amide III	-	•	-	•	-	-	-	-
~ 1327	Stretching C-N thymine, adenine	-	-	-	-	-	•	-	•
~ 1393		-	-	-	-	•	-	-	-
~ 1400		•	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
~ 1404	CH <sub>3</sub> asymmetric deformation	-	-	-	•	-	-	-	-
~ 1423		-	-	-	-	-	•	•	٠
~ 1458	Lipids and proteins	-	-	-	-	-	-	•	-
~ 1462		-	-	-	•	-	-	-	•
~ 1468		-	-	-	-	-	•	-	-
~ 1470	CH <sub>2</sub> bending of the methylene chains in lipids	-	-	-	-	•	-	-	-
~ 1477		-	-	•	-	-	-	-	-
~ 1520	Amide II	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	•
~ 1540	Protein amide II absorption	-	-	-	-	•	-	-	-
~ 1555	Ring base	-	٠	٠	•	-	-	-	-
~ 1574	C=N adenine	•	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
~ 1577	C-C stretch	-	-	-	-	-	•	-	-

~ 1601	C=N cytosine	-	-	-	-	٠	-	-	-
~ 1612		•	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
~ 1624		-	-	-	-	-	•	-	-
~ 1632	C-C stretch	-	-	-	•	-	-	-	-
~ 1639	Amide	-	-	-	-	-	-	•	-
~ 1647	Amide I	-	-	•	-	•	-	-	-
~ 1652	Amide I	•	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
~ 1666	C=O stretching vibration of pyrimidine base	-	-	-	-	-	•	-	•
~ 1670	Amide I	-	•	-	-	-	-	-	-
~ 1694	Proteins	-	-	-	-	-	-	•	-
~ 1706	C=O thymine	-	•	-	-	-	-	-	-
~ 1725	C=O band	•	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
~ 1740	C=O, lipids	-	-	-	-	-	-	•	•
~ 1750	v(C=C) lipids, fatty acids	-	-	•	-	•	-	-	-

### *3.2 Spectrochemical alterations with long-term AgNP/tetracycline exposure*

205 To identify exposure-induced alterations, the spectral data of each treatment group are compared with the control group at the same time point, eliminating the impacts of cell 206 207 growth and nutrient depletion (Figure 2). In Gram-positive M. Vanbaalenii, the AgNPinduced alterations are C-C, C-O deoxyribose (~964 cm<sup>-1</sup>), phosphate (~1212 cm<sup>-1</sup>), Amide 208 III (~1307 cm<sup>-1</sup>), ring base (~1555 cm<sup>-1</sup>), Amide I (~1670 cm<sup>-1</sup>), and C=O thymine (~1706 209  $cm^{-1}$ )<sup>30, 33, 38</sup>. Post-exposure to tetracycline, the representative peaks are DNA (~1084 cm<sup>-1</sup>), 210  $PO_2^-$  stretching in RNA and DNA (~1220 cm<sup>-1</sup>), ring base (~1555 cm<sup>-1</sup>), Amide I (~1647 211 cm<sup>-1</sup>), lipids, and fatty acids (~1750 cm<sup>-1</sup>)<sup>33, 38, 48</sup>. With the binary exposure, the alterations 212 are different from individual exposures, and the specific spectral biomarkers are DNA (~1084 213 cm<sup>-1</sup>), PO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup> stretching in RNA and DNA (~1220 cm<sup>-1</sup>), Amide III (~1307 cm<sup>-1</sup>), CH<sub>3</sub> 214 asymmetric deformation (~1404 cm<sup>-1</sup>, ~1462 cm<sup>-1</sup>), ring base (~1555 cm<sup>-1</sup>), and C-C stretch 215  $(\sim 1632 \text{ cm}^{-1})^{38, 48}$ . It is worth mentioning that the binary effects of AgNP and tetracycline on 216 M. vanbaalenii spectra are mainly driven by tetracycline as more identical discriminating 217 peaks are observed between these two groups (Table 1). To evaluate the impacts of each 218 exposure, PCA-LDA score plots were generated and illustrate the increasing segregation 219 220 between groups with increasing exposure time (from day 3 to day 12, Figure 3). Particularly, the biochemical distances of tetracycline and binary groups are co-located, apparently 221 222 separated from the control group and markedly on day 12. However, the AgNP-treated groups only show slight shifting of biochemical differences compared to the control group. 223 224 This result is consistent with cluster vectors analysis that the binary-exposure effects in M. 225 vanbaalenii are closer to tetracycline alone than AgNP.



226

Figure 2. Cluster vectors plots after PCA-LDA, indicating significant wavenumbers for the
segregation of *M. vanbaalenii* and *P. fluorescens* following long-term exposure (day 3 to day
12) to AgNP, tetracycline or their mixtures.

230



231

**Figure 3.** PCA-LDA score plots for the biospectral alteration of *M. vanbaalenii* and *P.* 

*fluorescens* following long-term exposure (day 3 to day 12) to AgNP, tetracycline or theirmixtures.

#### In Gram-negative P. fluorescens, all the exposure groups are clearly separated from the 235 control group in the PCA-LDA score plots (Figure 3), and there is no significant difference 236 between each treatment. The AgNP-induced alterations include stretching C-N thymine, 237 adenine (~1327 cm<sup>-1</sup>), lipids and proteins (~1458 cm<sup>-1</sup>), C-C stretch (~1577 cm<sup>-1</sup>), (~1624 238 $cm^{-1}$ ), and C=O stretching vibration of pyrimidine base (~1666 $cm^{-1}$ )<sup>48</sup>. The tetracycline-239 induced peaks are DNA (~1220 cm<sup>-1</sup>); (~1423 cm<sup>-1</sup>), collagen (~1458 cm<sup>-1</sup>), Amide I (~1639 240 cm<sup>-1</sup>, ~1694 cm<sup>-1</sup>), and C=O lipids (~1740 cm<sup>-1</sup>)<sup>38, 48</sup>. Generally, outer cellular components 241 are widely affected by both AgNP and tetracycline, including Amides I/II and proteins 242 (~1307 cm<sup>-1</sup>, ~1647 cm<sup>-1</sup>, 1639 -1694 cm<sup>-1</sup>), and lipids and/or fatty acids (1750 cm<sup>-1</sup>, 1458 243 cm<sup>-1</sup>, 1740 cm<sup>-1</sup>)<sup>30, 33, 38, 48</sup>, indicating that the cell membrane is the primary reactive target 244 associated with both antimicrobials which penetrate bacterial cells via passive diffusion and 245 inhibit bacterial growth by perturbing protein synthesis or altering membrane structure<sup>51</sup>. 246 Additionally, more inner cellular components are identified to be associated with tetracycline 247 exposure than AgNP, *e.g.*, inherent DNA and RNA, possibly due to the antibiotic mechanism 248 of tetracycline which blocks the elongation cycle by preventing incoming aminoacyl-tRNA 249 (aa-tRNA) from binding to the ribosomal A-site and inhibiting protein synthesis<sup>52</sup>. Different 250 from Gram-positive strains, AgNP-induced alterations contribute predominantly to the binary 251 effects in *P. fluorescens*, *i.e.*, stretching C-N thymine, adenine (~1327 cm<sup>-1</sup>, ~1423 cm<sup>-1</sup>, 252 ~1462 cm<sup>-1</sup>), Amide II (~1520 cm<sup>-1</sup>), C=O stretching vibration of pyrimidine base (~1666 253 cm<sup>-1</sup>), and C=O lipids (~1740 cm<sup>-1</sup>)<sup>31, 34</sup>. These findings imply the antimicrobial synergism 254 of AgNP and tetracycline. A previous study suggests that antibiotics' efficacy against 255 256 microbes may increase in the presence of AgNP because of the bonding reaction between 257 antibiotics and nanofillers, owing to the chelating reaction of hydroxyl and amide groups in 258 antibiotic molecules with AgNP<sup>53</sup>.

# 259 3.3 Impacts of exposure time on spectrochemical alterations

Although short-term impacts by antimicrobials on bacteria is obvious and well-studied, their 260 consequences may last for extended periods and remain unknown<sup>54</sup>. To unravel such long-261 term exposure effects, we measured the biospectral alterations at different time points, and 262 found distinguishing biomarkers post-exposure to antimicrobials between short-term versus 263 264 long-term treatments (Figure 4). Generally, in short-term exposure ( $\leq 3$  days), spectral changes are associated with components from cell membranes wherein most antimicrobial-265 induced alterations occur in both strains, including glycogen (~1022 cm<sup>-1</sup>), symmetric 266 phosphate stretching vibrations (v<sub>s</sub>PO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>; ~1088 cm<sup>-1</sup>, 1092 cm<sup>-1</sup>), carbohydrates (~1165 267

cm<sup>-1</sup>), protein phosphorylation (~964 cm<sup>-1</sup>), Amide I (~1609 cm<sup>-1</sup>, 1612 cm<sup>-1</sup>, 1659 cm<sup>-1</sup>, 268 ~1670 cm<sup>-1</sup>), Amide III (~1269 cm<sup>-1</sup>), COO- symmetric stretching vibrations of fatty acids 269 and amino acid (~1408 cm<sup>-1</sup>), proteins (~1485 cm<sup>-1</sup>, ~1550 cm<sup>-1</sup>, ~1650 cm<sup>-1</sup>), and lipids 270 (~1701 cm<sup>-1</sup>, 1705-1750 cm<sup>-1</sup>)<sup>30, 32, 38, 48</sup>. Besides external cellular components, some 271 272 inherent elements are significantly influenced in long-term exposure (>3 days). For instance, long-term tetracycline-induced alterations in P. fluorescens include RNA and DNA (e.g., 273 ~1220 cm<sup>-1</sup>, ~1423 cm<sup>-1</sup>). Compared to prolonged exposure, short exposure induces minimal 274 alterations, possibly owing to bacteria undergoing pre-stage reactions against antimicrobials. 275 276 During extended exposure periods, the more obvious biospectral alterations might be explained by increasing tetracycline accumulation via penetration and stronger antibiotic 277 effects, which prevent RNA binding to the ribosomal A-site and protein synthesis<sup>52</sup>, and 278 further inhibit RNA/DNA synthesis and duplication<sup>55</sup>. Another explanation is the post-279 antibiotic effect (PAE) or lag of bacterial regrowth induced by long-term antimicrobial 280 exposure, driving bacterial entry into a growth suppression state<sup>56, 57</sup>. 281





**Figure 4.** PCA-LDA score plots of the biospectral alteration of *M. vanbaalenii* and *P.* 

284 *fluorescens* in both short-term and long-term exposure to AgNP, tetracycline and their

- mixtures. T<sub>0</sub>, T<sub>1</sub>, T<sub>2</sub>, T<sub>3</sub>, T<sub>4</sub> and T<sub>5</sub> represent exposure time of 2 h, 2 days, 3 days, 6 days, 9  $\frac{1}{2}$
- days and 12 days, respectively.

### 288 3.4 Influential factors determining bacterial long-term responses to antimicrobials

Although distinct impacts of different antimicrobials on bacteria have been well-documented, 289 290 many variables including intrinsic and external factors may alter such influences in realworld scenarios. In the present study, we evaluated bacterial type, exposure category, 291 292 exposure time and nutrient depletion, but which factor is the most dominating remains unlcear. To answer this question, a multivariate regression trees (MRT) analysis based on 293 isolated discriminating biomarkers is conducted to quantify the impacts of these four factors 294 on spectral alterations. MRT visualizes these influencing factors on spectral variations in a 295 296 tree with four splits based on exposure time, exposure category, bacterial type and nutrient depletion, explaining 63.7% of the total spectral variance (Figure 5). Level of influence is 297 298 ranked as exposure time > exposure type > bacterial type = nutrient depletion. Exposure time 299 accounts for 17.8% of the total variance, with the first split separating the group of 12-day exposure owing to the relatively lower intensities of DNA. In the 12-day exposure group, 300 301 exposure category explains 16.1% of the variance and splits spectra into two groups of control/tetracycline and AgNP/binary, mainly based on DNA spectral biomarkers. The group 302 of exposure <12 days is further split by bacterial type, accounting for 14.9% of the total 303 304 variance and attributed to differences in DNA, phospholipid-derived fatty acids and proteins. The final split representing nutrient depletion separates the groups of 6-9 day and 0-3 day for 305 306 Gram-positive bacteria (*M. vanbaalenii*, 14.9%), owing to higher cellular activities reflected by significant variations in DNA, phospholipid-derived fatty acids and proteins. 307

308 The MRT results are consistent with PCA-LDA score plots (Figure 4). The spectral distances of P. fluorescens, for instance, are similar regardless of exposure categories from 309 day 9 due to cell regeneration against the exposure and exhibiting resistance to 310 antimicrobials<sup>46</sup>. A prior study reported that long-term exposure (5 days) to 1  $\mu$ g/L of 311 tetracycline shows no apparent effect on cyanobacterial cells due to their natural variability in 312 tetracycline resistance<sup>58</sup>. It might explain the closer distance between groups of control and 313 tetracycline. Moreover, the distinct behaviours of M. vanbaalenii and P. fluorescens upon 314 starvation can explain the fourth split in MRT, i.e., M. vanbaalenii enters a replicative state 315 after 6-day exposure to adapt to conditions of insufficient nutrients, whereas P. fluorescens 316 317 appears more susceptible to nutrient depletion and starts regrowth. Evidence can be found from the additional collular components produced in Gram-negative P. fluorescens, e.g., fatty 318 acids (~1750 cm<sup>-1</sup>), as their predominant energy to survive<sup>46</sup>. 319



Error: 0.364 CV Error: 0.572 SE: 0.119

#### 320

Figure 5. Multivariate regression tree (MRT) analysis of environmental variables explaining discriminating biomarkers. The scale of the sub-figures reflects the alteration degree (number one represents the average level). Red bars represent biomarkers assigned to DNA; blue bars represent biomarkers associated with proteins; yellow bars represent biomarkers assigned to phospholipid-derived fatty acids; and, grey bars represent other cellular components.

326

327 Moreover, bacterial type may also have impacts on the consequences posed by antimicrobials 328 since bacteria differ in their cellular structures. Antimicrobials acting as both efficient 329 eliminators to microbes and selective agents help to propagate organisms with resistance ability<sup>59</sup>. Herein, we found discriminating alterations between Gram-positive and Gram-330 negative strains within the same exposure treatment. All the treatments exhibit distinct 331 alterations in Gram-positive M. vanbaalenii under nutrient depletion conditions (Day 3 to 332 Day 12), although AgNP generates very limited impact as compared to tetracycline or binary 333 exposure groups; these are not observed in *P. fluorescens*. The results from PCA-LDA scores 334 plots (Figure 3) and MRT (Figure 5) also show induced alterations in *M. vanbaalenii* are 335 significant compared to P. fluorescens. Furthermore, after long-term exposure (12 days), 336

Gram-negative P. fluorescens exhibit a broad range of spectral alterations assigned to lipids 337 and/or fatty acid (e.g., 1458 cm<sup>-1</sup>, 1740 cm<sup>-1</sup>), which are absent in Gram-positive M. 338 vanbaalenii, mainly attributed to their different cell wall structures. The rigidity and extended 339 cross-linking may reduce the target sites in cell membranes for environmental exposures and 340 afford further protection to cells from antimicrobial penetration<sup>12, 53</sup>. It implies that cell 341 membranes of Gram-negative bacteria are more likely to be influenced compared to Gram-342 positive bacteria under certain antibacterial treatments (e.g., AgNP)<sup>12, 50, 60</sup>. Past studies report 343 the oxidation of smaller AgNPs (1-10 nm) by intercellular reactive oxygen species (ROS) in 344 345 Gram-negative bacteria, resulting in the release of silver ions during AgNP penetration through the cell membrane and entrance into the cytoplasm<sup>60</sup>. These silver ions could be 346 further transferred to other Gram-negative bacterial cells, the membrane and cytoplasm which 347 contain many sulfur-containing proteins for the released Ag<sup>+</sup> to bind to and inactivate<sup>50, 60</sup>. 348 Furthermore, it has been recognised that heavy metal treatment can induce global 349 350 biomolecular changes in lipids and proteins, implying exotic exposure may lead to the development of relevant metabolic changes in cellular components, particularly the 351 membrane<sup>61-63</sup>. A recent study, for instance, reported that Ag exposure could increase cellular 352 lipid contents while decrease membrane fluidity<sup>61</sup>, and the possible mechanism is upregulated 353 354 lipid biosynthesis, which is known to be associated with the reduced membrane permeability.

Besides bacterial type, exposure time and exposure category, nutrient depletion is also 355 found to be an influential factor in the bacterial antimicrobial response. Here, bacterial cells 356 tend to adapt to new environmental stimuli after entering into a long-term nutrient-deprived 357 situation. From the cluster vectors analysis (Figure 1), spectral alterations in both strains from 358 Day 6 show slight peak shifts, which can be regarded as a potential signal showing that 359 bacterial cells are undergoing adaption. Additionally, M. vanbaalenii becomes a persistent 360 361 suspension in the media on entering a dormant state from Day 6. This is because bacteria in a non-growing state can survive for much longer time under conditions of reduced oxygen or 362 nutrient deprivation<sup>46, 47</sup>. Upon starvation, bacterial cells fragment into small spheroids 363 exhibiting rapid and drastic decreases in endogenous metabolism. This reorganization gives 364 365 bacteria maximum survival during long-term starvation. Specifically, bacteria on starvation initially induce dwarfing generating cell number increases via fragmentation over the first 1 366 to 2 h and continuous size reductions in the fragmented cells, but no further increase in 367 numbers. After dwarfing phases, cell size continues to get smaller, with little or no metabolic 368 activity, and slow loss of viability<sup>64</sup>. It has been reported that non-growing phase bacteria 369

adapt to and increase their tolerance to environmental stresses and such developed persistent
bacilli are capable of surviving several months of combinatorial antibiotic treatment<sup>47</sup>, which
implies that stressed living conditions, to some extent and paradoxically, could help microbial
resistance to antimicrobial effects.

### 374 **4.** Conclusions

In the present study, we employed spectrochemical analysis coupled with multivariate 375 analysis as a robust tool towards investigating bacterial responses<sup>65</sup> to long-term and low-376 level exposure of antimicrobials under nutrient depletion conditions. ATR-FTIR spectroscopy 377 378 shows feasibility in revealing sufficient biochemical information continuously even at extremely low-level exposures in a starvation situation, which fits better with real-world 379 380 circumstances and the natural state of microcosms. From the multivariate analysis of spectra coupled with MRT, we evaluate the significance of different factors on long-term bacterial 381 responses to antimicrobials and find pivotal roles for exposure time and nutrient depletion. 382 Nutrient depletion can drive bacterial cells to either enter into a dormant state or exhibit 383 extra-cellular components against environmental antimicrobials, consequently causing a 384 385 broader range of spectral alteration compared to short-term exposures. Differences in bacterial behaviours towards antimicrobials are also found between bacterial types (Gram-386 positive versus Gram-negative) attributed to variations in cell wall structure. Our work is the 387 first revealing of the more important roles of exposure duration and nutrient depletion, rather 388 than of antimicrobial reagents, on microbial responses to low-level and prolonged 389 environmental exposures. We believe this approach has an important future with potential 390 391 feasibility in *in situ* screening of environmental exposures in real-time.

# **392 Conflicts of interest**

393 There are no conflicts of interest to declare.

## 394 Acknowledgement

N.J. was funded by Chinese Academy of Sciences and China Scholarship Council.

396

397

# 399 **References**

1. J. Conly, Can. Med. Assoc. J., 2002, 167, 885-891. 400 J. W. Harrison and T. A. Svec, *Quintessence Int.*, 1998, 29, 223-229. 401 2. J. C. Chee-Sanford, R. I. Aminov, I. J. Krapac, N. Garrigues-Jeanjean and R. I. 3. 402 Mackie, Appl. Environ. Microbiol., 2001, 67, 1494-1502. 403 G. Hamscher, S. Sczesny, H. Hoper and H. Nau, Anal Chem, 2002, 74, 1509-1518. 404 4. X. L. Ji, Q. H. Shen, F. Liu, J. Ma, G. Xu, Y. L. Wang and M. H. Wu, J. Hazard 405 5. Mater., 2012, 235, 178-185. 406 L. Cantas, S. Q. A. Shah, L. M. Cavaco, C. M. Manaia, F. Walsh, M. Popowska, H. 407 6. Garelick, H. Burgmann and H. Sorum, Front. Microbiol., 2013, 4, 14. 408 7. A. Koluman and A. Dikici, Crit. Rev. Microbiol., 2013, 39, 57-69. 409 8. M. Tandukar, S. Oh, U. Tezel, K. T. Konstantinidis and S. G. Pavlostathis, Environ. 410 Sci. Technol., 2013, 47, 9730-9738. 411 9. J. L. Martinez and F. Baquero, Ups. J. Med. Sci., 2014, 119, 68-77. 412 10. J. S. Kim, E. Kuk, K. N. Yu, J. H. Kim, S. J. Park, H. J. Lee, S. H. Kim, Y. K. Park, Y. 413 H. Park, C. Y. Hwang, Y. K. Kim, Y. S. Lee, D. H. Jeong and M. H. Cho, Nanomed.-414 Nanotechnol. Biol. Med., 2014, 10, 1119-1119. 415 11. C. N. Lok, C. M. Ho, R. Chen, Q. Y. He, W. Y. Yu, H. Sun, P. K. H. Tam, J. F. Chiu 416 and C. M. Che, J. Biol. Inorg. Chem., 2007, 12, 527-534. 417 418 12. H. H. Lara, N. V. Ayala-Nunez, L. D. I. Turrent and C. R. Padilla, World J. Microbiol. Biotechnol., 2010, 26, 615-621. 419 C. Marambio-Jones and E. M. V. Hoek, J. Nanopart. Res, 2010, 12, 1531-1551. 420 13. R. J. Griffitt, N. J. Brown-Peterson, D. A. Savin, C. S. Manning, I. Boube, R. A. Ryan 421 14. and M. Brouwer, Environ. Toxicol. Chem., 2012, 31, 160-167. 422 A. Gupta and S. Silver, Nat. Biotechnol., 1998, 16, 888-888. 423 15. N. F. Jin, D. Y. Zhang and F. L. Martin, Integr. Biol., 2017, 9, 406-417. 424 16. P. Marschner, C. H. Yang, R. Lieberei and D. E. Crowley, Soil Biol Biochem, 2001, 17. 425 **33**, 1437-1445. 426 E. K. Costello, C. L. Lauber, M. Hamady, N. Fierer, J. I. Gordon and R. Knight, 427 18. 428 Science, 2009, 326, 1694-1697. 429 19. C. L. Lauber, M. Hamady, R. Knight and N. Fierer, Appl. Environ. Microbiol., 2009, 75, 5111-5120. 430 20. M. Wietz, B. Wemheuer, H. Simon, H. A. Giebel, M. A. Seibt, R. Daniel, T. 431 432 Brinkhoff and M. Simon, Environ. Microbiol., 2015, 17, 3822-3831. H. Li, F. L. Martin and D. Y. Zhang, Anal. Chem., 2017, 89, 3909-3918. 433 21. P. S. Stewart and J. W. Costerton, Lancet, 2001, 358, 135-138. 434 22. 23. N. Hoiby, T. Bjarnsholt, M. Givskov, S. Molin and O. Ciofu, Int. J. Antimicrob. 435 Agents, 2010, 35, 322-332. 436 437 24. C. G. Mayhall and E. Apollo, Antimicrob. Agents Chemother., 1980, 18, 784-788. 25. M. R. W. Brown, D. G. Allison and P. Gilbert, J. Antimicrob. Chemother., 1988, 22, 438 439 777-780. 440 26. S. M. Ede, L. M. Hafner and P. M. Fredericks, Appl. Spectrosc., 2004, 58, 317-322. 441 27. O. I. Kalantzi, R. Hewitt, K. J. Ford, L. Cooper, R. E. Alcock, G. O. Thomas, J. A. Morris, T. J. McMillan, K. C. Jones and F. L. Martin, Carcinogenesis, 2004, 25, 613-442 622. 443 J. L. Barber, M. J. Walsh, R. Hewitt, K. C. Jones and F. L. Martin, Mutagenesis, 2006, 28. 444 445 21, 351-360. 29. O. Fridman, A. Goldberg, I. Ronin, N. Shoresh and N. Q. Balaban, *Nature*, 2014, 513, 446 418-421. 447

- 448 30. F. L. Martin, J. G. Kelly, V. Llabjani, P. L. Martin-Hirsch, Patel, II, J. Trevisan, N. J.
  449 Fullwood and M. J. Walsh, *Nat. Protoc.*, 2010, 5, 1748-1760.
- M. J. Riding, F. L. Martin, J. Trevisan, V. Llabjani, Patel, II, K. C. Jones and K. T.
  Semple, *Environ. Pollut.*, 2012, 163, 226-234.
- 452 32. J. Li, R. Strong, J. Trevisan, S. W. Fogarty, N. J. Fullwood, K. C. Jones and F. L.
  453 Martin, *Environ. Sci. Technol.*, 2013, 47, 10005-10011.
- M. J. Baker, J. Trevisan, P. Bassan, R. Bhargava, H. J. Butler, K. M. Dorling, P. R.
  Fielden, S. W. Fogarty, N. J. Fullwood, K. A. Heys, C. Hughes, P. Lasch, P. L.
  Martin-Hirsch, B. Obinaju, G. D. Sockalingum, J. Sule-Suso, R. J. Strong, M. J.
- 457 Walsh, B. R. Wood, P. Gardner and F. L. Martin, *Nat. Protoc.*, 2014, **9**, 1771-1791.
- 458 34. K. A. Heys, M. J. Riding, R. J. Strong, R. F. Shore, M. G. Pereira, K. C. Jones, K. T.
  459 Semple and F. L. Martin, *Analyst*, 2014, **139**, 896-905.
- J. G. Kelly, J. Trevisan, A. D. Scott, P. L. Carmichael, H. M. Pollock, P. L. MartinHirsch and F. L. Martin, *J. Proteome Res.*, 2011, 10, 1437-1448.
- 462 36. J. Trevisan, P. P. Angelov, P. L. Carmichael, A. D. Scott and F. L. Martin, *Analyst*, 2012, **137**, 3202-3215.
- 464 37. N. Jin, M. Paraskevaidi, K. T. Semple, F. L. Martin and D. Y. Zhang, *Anal Chem*,
  465 2017, **89**, 9814-9821.
- 466 38. N. Jin, K. T. Semple, L. Jiang, C. Luo, D. Zhang and F. L. Martin, *Analyst*, 2018, 143, 768-776.
- 468 39. S. N. El Din, T. A. El-Tayeb, K. Abou-Aisha and M. El-Azizi, *Int. J. Nanomed.*, 2016,
  469 11, 1749-1758.
- 470 40. A. J. Kora and J. Arunachalam, World J. Microbiol. Biotechnol., 2011, 27, 1209-1216.
- 471 41. J. T. H. Jo, F. S. L. Brinkman and R. E. W. Hancock, *Antimicrob. Agents Chemother.*,
  472 2003, 47, 1101-1111.
- 473 42. H. Wu, X. Shi, H. Wang and J. Liu, J. Antimicrob. Chemother., 2000, 46, 121-123.
- 474 43. J. Trevisan, P. P. Angelov, A. D. Scott, P. L. Carmichael and F. L. Martin,
  475 *Bioinformatics*, 2013, **29**, 1095-1097.
- 476 44. F. L. Martin, M. J. German, E. Wit, T. Fearn, N. Ragavan and H. M. Pollock, *J. Comput. Biol.*, 2007, 14, 1176-1184.
- 478 45. J. Li, G. G. Ying, K. C. Jones and F. L. Martin, *Analyst*, 2015, **140**, 2687-2695.
- 479 46. J. C. Betts, P. T. Lukey, L. C. Robb, R. A. McAdam and K. Duncan, *Mol. Microbiol.*,
  480 2002, 43, 717-731.
- 47. T. Hampshire, S. Soneji, J. Bacon, B. W. James, J. Hinds, K. Laing, R. A. Stabler, P.
  482 D. Marsh and P. D. Butcher, *Tuberculosis*, 2004, **84**, 228-238.
- 483 48. Z. Movasaghi, S. Rehman and I. U. Rehman, *Appl. Spectrosc. Rev.*, 2008, **43**, 134-484 179.
- 485 49. M. Drapal, P. R. Wheeler and P. D. Fraser, *Microbiology-(UK)*, 2016, **162**, 1456-1467.
- J. R. Morones, J. L. Elechiguerra, A. Camacho, K. Holt, J. B. Kouri, J. T. Ramirez and M. J. Yacaman, *Nanotechnology*, 2005, 16, 2346-2353.
- 488 51. D. Schnappinger and W. Hillen, *Arch. Microbiol.*, 1996, **165**, 359-369.
- 489 52. S. R. Connell, C. A. Trieber, G. P. Dinos, E. Einfeldt, D. E. Taylor and K. H.
  490 Nierhaus, *Embo J.*, 2003, 22, 945-953.
- 491 53. A. M. Fayaz, K. Balaji, M. Girilal, R. Yadav, P. T. Kalaichelvan and R. Venketesan,
  492 *Nanomed.-Nanotechnol. Biol. Med.*, 2010, 6, 103-109.
- 493 54. C. Jernberg, S. Lofmark, C. Edlund and J. K. Jansson, *Microbiology-(UK)*, 2010, **156**, 3216-3223.
- 495 55. M. Argast and C. F. Beck, *Antimicrob. Agents Chemother.*, 1984, **26**, 263-265.
- 496 56. R. W. Bundtzen, A. U. Gerber, D. L. Cohn and W. A. Craig, *Rev. Infect. Dis.*, 1981, 3, 28-37.

- 57. K. Fuursted, A. Hjort and L. Knudsen, J. Antimicrob. Chemother., 1997, 40, 221-226. 498 58. F. Pomati, A. G. Netting, D. Calamari and B. A. Neilan, Aquat. Toxicol., 2004, 67, 499 387-396. 500 59. S. B. Levy, J. Antimicrob. Chemother., 2002, 49, 25-30. 501 Z. M. Xiu, J. Ma and P. J. J. Alvarez, Environ Sci Technol, 2011, 45, 9003-9008. 502 60. R. Gurbanov, S. N. Ozek, S. Tuncer, F. Severcan and A. G. Gozen, J. Biophotonics, 503 61. 2017, Doi: 10.1002/jbio.201700252. 504 R. Gurbanov, N. Simsek Ozek, A. G. Gozen and F. Severcan, Anal Chem, 2015, 87, 505 62. 9653-9661. 506 63. M. Kardas, A. G. Gozen and F. Severcan, Aquat Toxicol, 2014, 155, 15-23. 507 S. Kjelleberg, B. A. Humphrey and K. C. Marshall, Appl. Environ. Microbiol., 1983, 508 64. **46**, 978-984. 509 M. J. Riding, J. Trevisan, C. J. Hirschmugl, K. C. Jones, K. T. Semple and F. L. 510 65. Martin, Environ. Int., 2012, 50, 56-65. 511 512
- 513